

Special Meeting of the Town Board of the Town of Brighton was held on Tuesday, October 19, 2004, at 6:00 p.m. at the Brighton Town Hall, Paul Smiths, NY, with the following:

PRESENT: Supervisor Robert Tebbutt

Council Members: David Knapp, John Quenell, Steve Tucker and Lydia Wright

ABSENT: None

OTHERS PRESENT: Elaine Sater – Town Clerk, Nik Santagate - Justice and Tom Willis – Chair of Citizens Committee on Compensation and Benefits

GUESTS: None

RESIDENTS: There was one resident present

The meeting was **Called to Order** at 6:00 p.m. by Supervisor Robert Tebbutt. The purpose of the meeting was to discuss the 2005 Tentative Budget.

Notice of Meeting was posted on the Town Clerk's Sign Board as well as at three post offices and two businesses in the Town on October 13, 2004. A notice was faxed sent to the Adirondack Daily Enterprise on October 8, 2004.

1. 2005 TENTATIVE BUDGET OVERVIEW:

Supervisor Robert Tebbutt said he invited Tom Willis to attend the meeting since he was appointed by a resolution to be the Town's mentor for salaries and benefits. He has recommendations for the Board based on a report he created in 2002 comparing salary and benefits for this Town to other towns in the surrounding area.

Lydia Wright questioned why the board was using the recommendations from a report that was 2 ½ years old and was not used last year for setting salaries. There have been no reports to the Board from this committee during the year to show that they were active. She asked who the members of the committee were and when they met.

Tom Willis said Jack Burke and Nancy Rich were on the committee. The committee has not met this year. He had updated information to supplement the report for this budget process.

Supervisor Robert Tebbutt commented on the Budget process. He mentioned the different types of funds that make up the budget: General, Highway, Fire, and Street Lighting. The Capital Project Funds such as the Town Hall Restoration Project and the Highway Garage Project were not part of this process. Their budgets are determined by resolution. This meeting is focused on the General and Highway Fund. Two handouts were given to the Board. One illustrates the past Annual Tax Levies from 1997 to 2004. The Town has kept the Tax Levy below the "CPI" (Consumer Price Index) inflation figure. The other handout shows how the Tax Levy is determined by starting with Appropriations subtracting Revenues and Fund Balance Appropriations to obtain the Tax Levy. The process is to: 1) estimate appropriations and estimate revenues 2) The excess of appropriations over revenues has to be made up by taxes and appropriations from existing fund balances 3) Determine appropriations from fund balances 4) the remainder is what will be the tax levy. The estimates of appropriations and revenues will be done line by line, even though appropriations, revenues, and fund balance appropriations are agreed upon along the way, they can be revised before the final budget is adopted. At this meeting the budget format being used groups similar items together, such as wages and salaries, contractual commitments, and utilities. This format is easier to work with than the "official" state comptroller's format. When the Preliminary and Final budget submissions are made, they will be in the comptroller's format.

Supervisor Robert Tebbutt said he met with John Quenell and Tom Willis last week to discuss the information that Tom Willis has put together. He asked Tom Willis to explain what he has done.

Tom Willis said the sources of his data comes from a 2002 survey done of all the towns in Essex and Franklin Counties to determine what salaries and health care benefits they provided. There was a 72% response rate from 26 towns. Eleven of the towns were from Franklin and 15 were from Essex. The data from 26 towns was really too much to try to work with, some town were so much bigger and so much smaller so it did not make sense to compare Brighton to them all. A decision was made to use similar towns using the annual budget of each town to compare to Brighton. Towns with a budget between \$500,000 to 1 million dollars were selected and there were 11 such towns. They were Willsboro,

Elizabethtown, Westport, St. Armand, Essex, Belmont, Chateaugay, Lewis, Bangor, Moira, and North Hudson. The average budget for these towns was \$797,979 and Brighton was \$702,374. The recommendations for salaries were based on the data from the 11 towns. The towns treated health care differently so the data from all 26 towns was used for the recommendations. On the salary side some salaries were about right, some were below the comparator group, and others were above. Using the report it was determined that salaries need adjustment. On the health care side Brighton had the “Lincoln Continental” version of benefits for elected employees. The recommendation was to get salaries in line and try to get health benefits in line. As the Board goes line-by-line through the budget a history of each salary will be presented to show what has happened over time.

In 2002 the Town had the best health care benefits available to elected officials: medical, optical, and dental coverage at no cost to the insured. In 2003, the vision and dental were dropped and the insured paid 10% of the medical premium cost. In 2004 the 10% charge was dropped (medical insurance was changed).

The data from Franklin County towns for 2004 is now available as well as 2005 data from Santa Clara and Wilmington. He will just give the facts and the Board can make the decisions.

2. 2004 BUDGET AMENDMENT: Lydia Wright questioned the Board conducting Town business during Budget Workshops. The public was led to believe that only the 2005 Tentative Budget would be discussed at this meeting. If Town business needed to be conducted a special meeting should have been called and the public notified. **John Quenell** said this was a Special Meeting and the Board can conduct business. **Supervisor Robert Tebbutt** said he was doing it for the good of the Town. **Steve Tucker** asked what difference it made whether another meeting was called or it was done now.

RESOLUTION #107

AUTHORIZATION FOR BUDGET AMENDMENT #4 TO THE 2004 BUDGET GENERAL FUND

Motion made by Supervisor Robert Tebbutt, **second** by John Quenell, **To Wit:**

WHEREAS, the Town Board did not have information during the 2004 Budget Workshops for the increase cost of Medical Insurance, and

WHEREAS, funds were appropriated under General Fund Account Number A1990 Contingency in anticipation of an increase,

NOW, THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that Budget Amendment #4 to the 2004 Budget General Fund be authorized and the following amounts be and the same hereby appropriated and transferred: **\$13,100.00** from Account No. A1990 Contingency as follows: **\$13,000** to Account No. DA9060.8 Fringe Benefits – Medical Insurance and **\$100** to Account No., A1355.4 Assessor Contractual.

Roll Call Vote: Aye 4 (Knapp, Quenell, Tebbutt, Tucker), Abstain 1(Wright), Nay 0

Resolution #107 declared duly adopted.

3. 2005 TENTATIVE BUDGET REVIEW – SALARIES AND WAGES:

Discussion of salaries was a comparison of Town to information Tom Willis compiled. FC is Franklin County data for 2004. 2002 figures are from report compiled in 2002.

NAME	ACCT NO.	TOB 2004	HIGH 2002	LOW 2002	AVERAGE 2002	MEDIAN 2002	2002 Target Recommended	2005 BUDGET
Council	A1010.1	\$2300 each	\$4500 St Armand	\$1400 Moira	\$2505 FC – 2004 \$2004	\$2900 FC-2004 \$1670	\$2500	\$2300 No Change
Justice	A1110.1	\$6800	\$13,554 St Armand	\$3400 Bellmont	\$7074 FC – 2004 \$ 9000	\$7000 FC-2004 \$6500	\$7000	\$7500 Changed

Council members did not ask for an increase.

Justice Santagate asked for a fair salary increase. He questioned the survey from 2002 concerning the way the Justice’s salary was recorded. In towns with two judges the salaries should have been added together instead of only taking one salary to compare to our town that has one judge that does the same amount of work as two judges. The caseload should have been compared to show a more fair salary for the towns. Tom Willis questioned what made up a caseload. He did not know the reason for two judges in some

SPECIAL BOARD MEETING -TOWN OF BRIGHTON – OCTOBER 19, 2004

towns with a lesser caseload. Lydia Wright said contact hours should be looked at to compare if caseload is not enough. Brighton's caseload averages 656 per year. Nine other towns averaged 643 cases.

NAME	ACCT NO.	TOB 2004	HIGH 2002	LOW 2002	AVERAGE 2002	MEDIAN 2002	2002 Target Recommended	2005 BUDGET
Court Clerk	A1130.1	\$2000 (\$11.00 per Hr)	\$5100 Westport	\$2000 Essex	\$2900	\$2300	\$2500	\$2000 No Change
Supervisor	A1220.1	\$9500	\$21,000 Willsboro	\$7000 Moira	\$13,039 FC – 2004 \$8400	\$14,000 FC-2004 \$8500	\$13,000	\$9500 No Change
Deputy Supervisor	A1220.1A	\$250	No Data	ND	ND	ND	ND	\$250 No Change

Court Clerk is paid by hour and does not need to be increased.

David Knapp asked if towns of similar size should be used for comparing Supervisor salary based on workload. Tom Willis said amount of time in office could affect the salary. John Quenell said the size of the budget was probably a better indicator.

Discussion was held on eliminating the Deputy Supervisor salary. The board chose to leave it in so it would not be eliminated from the budget in the future. A discussion of the way a Deputy is paid was held. The salary is paid at the end of the year for the person being available.

NAME	ACCT NO.	TOB 2004	HIGH 2002	LOW 2002	AVERAGE 2002	MEDIAN 2002	2002 Target Recommended	2005 BUDGET
Bookkeeper	A1310.1	\$9600	ND	ND	ND	ND	ND	\$0 Contracted Out
Tax Collector	A1330.1	\$4500	\$6250 Willsboro	\$2200 Bangor	\$3174 FC-2004 \$2807	\$3027 FC-2004 \$2050	None - above range	\$4500 No Change
Budget Officer	A1340.4	\$250	ND	ND	ND	ND	ND	\$250 No Change
Assessor	A1355.1	\$10,000	\$18,400 Belmont	\$8000 Essex	\$12,280 FC-2004 \$13,815	\$12,000 FC-2004 \$9700	\$12,000	\$10,000 No Change

The Bookkeeper duties have been contracted out.

The Tax Collector is the 2nd highest paid in Franklin County. The last Tax Collector received \$6000 when she retired. Tax Collector is above target range.

Lydia Wright asked if the Budget Officer salary was not paid out if the Supervisor did not appoint another person to do the job. Supervisor Robert Tebbutt said he still received the salary since he did the work. The Assessor did not ask for a raise and he is near the recommended range.

NAME	ACCT NO.	TOB 2004	HIGH 2002	LOW 2002	AVERAGE 2002	MEDIAN 2002	2002 Target Recommended	2005 BUDGET
Town Clerk	A1410.1	\$8000	\$18,750 Willsboro	\$4324 Bellmont	\$7958 FC-2004 \$8430	ND FC-2004 \$4770	\$8000	\$8500 Changed
Town Hall Custodian	A1620.4	\$2000	ND	ND	\$8.60 per hour	\$9.16 per hour	4.25 hours at \$9.00 per hour	\$2000 No Change
Dog Control Warden	A3510.1	\$2060	\$1600 Bangor	\$350 North Hudson	\$986	\$1050	Already Above Highest	\$2060 No Change

Town Clerk is the 5th Highest paid in Franklin County. David Knapp said the Town Clerk does a lot of work, Steve Tucker said the board has held extra meetings over the last two years that has impacted the Clerk and he hopes there won't be so many extra meetings in the future.

Most Town Hall Custodians are paid by hour not salaried. Number of hours worked was not known.

SPECIAL BOARD MEETING -TOWN OF BRIGHTON – OCTOBER 19, 2004

Supervisor Robert Tebbutt said he had only received one report from the Dog Control Officer. This position could be contracted out to the Humane Society. Lydia Wright will contract them to see what they would charge. She asked if he responds during working hours or does he have to wait until after work. Nik Santagate said the advantage to having someone local return a dog to its home may not be legal as there is a danger in having a local person do the job if the dog has violated a law.

NAME	ACCT NO.	TOB 2004	HIGH 2002	LOW 2002	AVERAGE 2002	MEDIAN 2002	2002 Target Recommended	2005 BUDGET
Registrar of Vital Statistics	A4020.1	\$200	ND	ND	ND	ND	ND	\$200 No Change
Highway Superintendent	A5010.1	\$33,000	\$38,756 Willsboro	\$21,000 North Hudson	\$30,317 FC-2004 \$	\$30,000	Keep up with Union workers increase	\$34,000 Changed
Deputy Superintendent of Highways	A5010.11	\$570	\$3000	\$500	\$1300	\$1100	Pay \$3.76 extra per hour worked	\$600 Changed

Registrar of Vitals Statistics did not ask for an increase.

The Superintendent of Highways asked for a \$1000 raise to keep pace with the Highway Employees. He has had a \$1000 ever year since 2002. Practice in the past has been to give him a raise maintain a relationship with the Union employees. Lydia Wright said that to be fair all the elected positions should be given a 3% cost-of-living increase. John Quenell said that until all the salaries are within the range that can't be done. Tom Willis said the Superintendent of Highways is a different position because of the employees he oversees. The Justice said he would make \$8.00 per hour with a raise and his Court Clerk makes \$11.00 per hour so that reasoning shouldn't apply. David Knapp said he was under the impression that what ever the salary was when he took office was his salary for the full term. He did not realize it could change. He would like to know the difference between the Superintendent of Highways and the employees. The highway employees receive \$12.22 per hour and \$18.33 for overtime. The Superintendent of Highways averages out to \$15.87 per hour for 40 hours a week. Supervisor Robert Tebbutt said the Superintendent of Highways works more than 40 hours a week. David Knapp said the difference between the pay per hour is consistent with the civilian world.

The Deputy Superintendent of Highways was compared to all 26 towns because of the lack of data. Some pay extra per hour, some pay a set amount like Brighton. Tom Willis figured out that if the Deputy was paid the difference between his hourly and the Superintendents hourly while the Superintendent was on vacation for four weeks it would equal \$600.

NAME	ACCT NO.	TOB 2004	HIGH 2002	LOW 2002	AVERAGE 2002	MEDIAN 2002	2002 Target Recommended	2005 BUDGET
Town Park Manager (30 Hours a week)	A7140.1	\$11,650 (\$8.50 per hour)	ND	ND	ND	ND	ND	\$13,650 (\$8.75 per hour) Changed
Town Park Maintenance	A7140.1A	\$2000	ND	ND	ND	ND	ND	\$0 Reduced
Cemetery Custodian	A8810.1	\$2000	ND	ND	ND	ND	ND	\$0 Contract Out

The Town Park Maintenance is eliminated because the Park Manager is currently doing the Maintenance. The Cemetery work will be contracted out.

Discussion of the General Fund Appropriations will continue at the next meeting on October 21, 2004.

Motion to Adjourn made at 8:05 p.m. by John Quenell, second by Steve Tucker

Roll Call Vote: Aye 5 (Knapp, Quenell, Tebbutt, Tucker, Wright), Nay 0

Respectfully Submitted,

Elaine Sater, Brighton Town Clerk