

PUBLIC HEARING (HIGHWAY GARAGE PROJECT) -TOWN OF BRIGHTON

APRIL 1, 2004

Page 1

A Public Hearing on the Highway Garage Project was held on Thursday, April 1, 2004, at 7:00 p.m. at the Brighton Town Hall, Paul Smiths, NY, with the following:

PRESENT: Supervisor Robert Tebbutt and Council Members: David Knapp, John Quenell, Steve Tucker and Lydia Wright

ABSENT: None

OTHERS PRESENT: Elaine Sater - Town Clerk, Don Oliver - Superintendent of Highways, and Highway Department employees

RESIDENTS: There were twenty residents present.

GUEST: Joe Garso, PE, North Woods Engineering

The Public Hearing was Called to Order by Supervisor Robert Tebbutt at 7:00 p.m. The purpose of the hearing is to provide information to the public and to hear their comments on the Highway Garage Project.

Notice of the Meeting was faxed to the Adirondack Daily Enterprise on Thursday, March 18, 2004, and published on March 25, 2004. The notice was also posted on the Town Clerk's Sign Board, at the three post offices and at local businesses in the Town.

Supervisor Robert Tebbutt read a statement to the public reviewing the events to date. The Board passed a financing resolution on February 11 that was subject to permissive referendum. A petition was received on March 12 objecting to the financing resolution and the Town Board scheduled a referendum for May 11 and this public hearing to continue the dialogue about this project. The financing resolution authorizes the acquisition of 4.67 acres of land adjacent to the existing garage, payment of construction cost for a five-bay garage, and construction of a salt shed through issuance of \$500,000 serial bonds plus \$100,000 from General Fund reserves to pay for the project. The signers of the petition stated they thought this was a large capital building project and should be voted on by the public. Most people support the construction of a new garage but are concerned about the size, the design, and the cost. On September 11, 2003, the Town Board appointed a Highway Garage Project Committee with Co-Chairs David Knapp and Rouse Fountain. They have worked on an alternate plan to what was proposed before. David Knapp will present the Project at this meeting. Rouse Fountain sent an email to be read at this meeting.

Letter from Rouse Fountain:

"First I want to thank David Knapp for calling me in March 24th to inform me on the progress of the highway garage.

I was very disappointed to hear that once again, some residents had filed a petition stopping the project, thus requiring a new vote from the general public.

After my phone conversation with David Knapp, and once again studying the garage project, I stand firmly behind the last garage plans presented to the town board and the public by David Knapp, Art Robertson and Rouse Fountain on February 12, 2003 at the town board meeting.

I feel that this will be a one-time project and it must be done the right way, and any changes would only be costly in years to come.

I mentioned to David Knapp that we should look into possibly some savings in regard to the septic system, salt shed, gas and fuel tanks (regarding location), and finished grade.

Also in regard to this delay:

#1 The first delay cost the town time and money

#2 This new delay could be very costly with energy, gas, fuel, electricity, etc. going up with no end in sight. It could be devastating in regard to the cost of the project. I have spoken to two contractors here in Florida. They are looking at a 20%-40% increase in steel, concrete and other building materials.

I realize that everyone today is concerned with the cost of living, and especially with taxes. But I feel that if we don't move ahead with the garage project soon we may be forced into doing it by some government agency or insurance company. Then the cost could be devastating to the town.

Yours truly

Rouse A. Fountain"

PUBLIC HEARING (HIGHWAY GARAGE PROJECT) -TOWN OF BRIGHTON

APRIL 1, 2004

Page 2

Joe Garso, PE, North Woods Engineering, was introduced to the public. He is the engineer for the Highway Garage Project. He was invited to answer technical questions.

David Knapp – Co-Chair, Highway Garage Project Committee: Re-looked at the original plans and did some brainstorming to try to reduce costs to the project. Showed the public a sketch of the plan presented to the Town Board. It has the same footprint as the original plan but is a different design. The amount of concrete used in the building is reduced by moving one of the bays to the outside and making it a cold storage bay. There are four heated bays. This would also reduce the heating costs. The roof over the administrative section was lowered. The floor under this section could be less weight bearing. The shed roof style will reduce the amount of steel used in that section also. Another sketch showed one outside bays with only three heated bays inside.

The floor was opened to the public:

Chris Godfrey - County Route 60: He looked at the current building and doesn't see why that building can't be renovated for half the money. There is a crack in the corner that needs to be fixed. The rest of the building looked sound.

Pat Willis – Garondah Road: She would like to hear the answer to Chris Godfrey's question. Can the garage be repaired or not? This question is on people's minds.

John Quenell answered that the current garage is not large enough to get all the equipment under the roof. The heating system is archaic and needs to be replaced. In-floor heating is preferred to work on the equipment. The whole building needs insulation. The whole structure needs to be raised up 3 feet to provide a drainage system underneath. DEC is concerned about the contamination of the soil underneath. A new roof is needed.

Supervisor Robert Tebbutt added that the whole building needs to be brought up to building code standards and a new APA permit would have to be submitted. There are serious ground water issues that need to be addressed. The grade around the garage needs to be raised up above the water table. The project also addresses remediating the ground under the current garage. A wastewater treatment plant has to be added. He asked Joe Garso to confirm what he said.

Joe Garso said he could not speak to what repairs the current building needs because it was not part of his charge to look at it. The building would have to be brought up to code especially fire safety code. The equivalent cost would be close to the cost of a new building.

Bob Tummons – Rainbow Lake: Asked what the Town had in writing from DEC concerning the garage, specifying what the Town needed to do.

Joe Garso answered that by state law the mining operation was required to have a 5-foot separation between the bottom of the pit and any structure. When pit tests were done in the mine it was 2 feet below the minimum standard. The whole pit has to be raised up to meet standards before any work can be done.

Supervisor Robert Tebbutt said the Town currently does not have a deadline to correct this problem because it is addressed in the building project. There is a verbal agreement with DEC until this is settled.

Art Robertson – Split Rock Road: It has been pointed out that the Town can't start building a new garage until a APA permit is approved. When do you expect to get approval so you can start building? How long will it be before you can start building if the bond is approved?

Supervisor Robert Tebbutt answered that the application for the permit is suspended until the funding is approved. The APA was close to approving it; the wastewater issue still has to be addressed. The Town didn't want to spend any more money on the project because they were not sure what they were going to do after the bond was defeated the first time.

PUBLIC HEARING (HIGHWAY GARAGE PROJECT) -TOWN OF BRIGHTON

APRIL 1, 2004

Page 3

Joe Garso said the significant issues (storm-water runoff, vegetation, salt shed, mining operation) have been addressed with the APA and it should take 30 to 45 days to get approval of the application.

Gould Hoyt – Keese Mills Road: Asked where the septic system would be in relation to the main structure of the garage. Will it be draining into the water across the road?

Joe Garso answered that the septic system will be parallel to the road. The garage will be back off the road behind the natural bank and vegetation. The area will be dug out to fill in the pit bottom. The building will be perpendicular to the road and the septic will be up on the hill behind it. Due to the soil conditions it should not leak into the water.

Lydia Wright said residents have asked her if it would be possible to use the current garage to some degree for cold storage for some of the extra equipment.

Supervisor Robert Tebbutt said he understood that only one building could be on the property. The Town is not purchasing the building rights with the new land from Paul Smith College.

Joe Garso added that the APA was happy that the Town was planning to build a new building further away from the road than the current building.

Supervisor Robert Tebbutt asked Lydia Wright to read a letter from a resident who could not attend the meeting.

Lydia Wright read the following email from Kevan Moss:

“1 April 2004

RE: Proposed Town Garage

Dear Town of Brighton Board,

The overriding issue of this public forum is not that the Town needs a new garage. It does. It's not that we taxpayers will pay \$10 dollars, \$20 dollars or \$50 dollars more in taxes to finance it. We will pay for the garage. The overriding issue is whether the structure you are proposing to build is appropriate for our small town with only 21 miles of roads to maintain.

Is there a written, town-wide plan that takes into account the overall budget needs for this project and for the maintenance needs for our existing town buildings: the cemetery buildings, the town park buildings and the town hall? Why can't some of the Town's surplus funds, specifically the \$141,000 general class fund, be allocated to maintaining these other important Town assets? What guarantee do we have that you will not deplete this surplus on the garage, leaving nothing for on-going maintenance?

Respectfully submitted,

Kevan N. Moss, Taxpayer”

Lydia Wright said that there has been a general lack of maintenance for all town buildings and the concern was for spending the Town's entire surplus on the Garage and leaving nothing for the rest of the Town.

Supervisor Robert Tebbutt answered that the Town is a little heavy on reserve funds right now and according to the Comptroller's Office it is appropriate for the Town to spend it on this type of project. If the Town spends \$100,000 from the fund there are still surplus funds in the account.

Lydia Wright said there are two surplus accounts: one for General Fund and the other for Highway. There is \$141,000 in the General Fund and \$101,000 in the Highway Fund. From which account does the \$100,000 for the highway garage come?

Supervisor Robert Tebbutt said it comes from the General Fund account. The construction of buildings comes from the General Fund.

John Quenell said the \$101,000 from the surplus Highway Fund is for replacing highway equipment.

PUBLIC HEARING (HIGHWAY GARAGE PROJECT) -TOWN OF BRIGHTON

APRIL 1, 2004

Page 4

Tracie Santagate - McColloms: Said she attends most of the Town Board meetings and has a conservative view which is why she takes the position she does. \$600,000 is too much to spend on a garage for this size town. The other Town buildings should be maintained with the surplus funds. The highway department is fund heavy. They have already spent \$125,000 for a snowplow and \$100,000 for a loader. All the town's resources should not be spent on the highway department. It took a year for the Board to approve \$2,000 for computers for the Tax Collector and the Bookkeeper after they budgeted for them. The Board won't spend \$2,500 for a program for the Tax Collector to do her job and she has to deal with all the taxpayers in the town. Not all the Town's taxpayers benefit from the Highway Department. Maybe this garage is too big a project for the Town. With the proposed plan the Town will be heating equipment that is not used. She does appreciate the idea of a cold storage bay in the plan. The disparity between the spending in departments in the town is too great. There is a purchase imbalance.

Art Robertson asked what alternative Tracie Santagate would propose to the garage situation.

Tracie Santagate replied that two years ago the highway was happy to have a garage attached to the salt shed. She is not opposed to a new garage but she is opposed to the size. The prep work is \$125,000 of the project. She objects to \$480,00 to \$500,000 for a building.

Gould Hoyt asked if the concrete floor with tubing in it would stand up to the weight of the vehicles? Will the floor have to be taken up to repair any leaks?

Supervisor Robert Tebbutt said that he visited to-date close to 20 garages in northern New York. All but two had in-floor heating. They all raved about how great it was to have in the garage.

Joe Garso answered that the type of material is called "PECKS" that was developed about 50 years ago in Germany. It is one long molecule and is very strong because there are not many places it can break. It will also be encased in concrete. The concrete floor will not break up because floor loadings are part of the design and preparation.

Gould Hoyt said he was concerned about the ground being built up first below the building then putting the concrete on top of that. The plow is heavy and puts a lot of pressure on the floor. What guarantee does the Town have this will hold up under the weight of the trucks?

Joe Garso said that design and placement of the concrete slab would have to be monitored. His company will be present during the critical early construction phases to oversee the process.

Supervisor Robert Tebbutt asked the Highway Department if they had any comments. None were made.

Debbie McBride – Keese Mills Road: Asked about the Wicks Law and prevailing wage. Why are we talking about \$600,000 if the building can be built for \$333,000 to \$385,000 according to the handout? Does this include the \$125,000 for prep work?

John Quenell answered that the Wicks Law and prevailing wage increases the cost of the building up to \$500,000.

Joe Garso added the Highway Department can do work outside the building but the contractor is responsible for the building and a certain distance from the building.

Supervisor Robert Tebbutt said he asked the Comptroller if volunteers could build the building and was told no.

Debbie McBride asked if the salt shed and purchase of the land could be separated from the garage project?

PUBLIC HEARING (HIGHWAY GARAGE PROJECT) -TOWN OF BRIGHTON

APRIL 1, 2004

Page 5

Supervisor Robert Tebbutt answered that as the project evolved the separation of the land and salt shed was brought up. The purchase of the land became a concern when the president of Paul Smith College left and a new board was formed. The current board has agreed to stand behind their decision to sell to the Town. John Quenell was able to find a grant for the salt shed.

John Quenell said the grant has not been distributed yet. The grant was applied for on 30 September 2003.

Supervisor Robert Tebbutt said the APA permit application is suspended and to change it would cause it to be cancelled and the Town would have to start again from the beginning.

Debbie McBride asked what portion of the bond goes to the land and to the salt shed?

Supervisor Robert Tebbutt said the land is \$7,000 and the salt shed was near \$60,000. The grant is for \$30,000 and the other \$30,000 would be made up of \$25,000 of in-kind services and \$5,000 of cash from the town.

Gould Hoyt asked if the salt shed was mandated by the State? If it is they should supply the funds to offset the cost.

Supervisor Robert Tebbutt said the State only mandates an impervious pad with a cover. The tarp blows off and gets damaged by the loader.

Don Oliver - Superintendent of Highways: Said that a salt shed is not mandated by law but it is highly recommended. It is hard to keep the tarp on the salt pile.

John Quenell said there is grant money available but the awards have not been made yet. It is part of the Clean Air/Clean Water Bond.

Dave Johnson – Rainbow Lake: The Town should have a good chance at getting the grant since this area has a greater need for a salt shed than other areas because of the watershed that needs to be protected. Asked if there was a break down of what we pay to the county and what we pay to the Town. If he could vote on the expenditures by the county it would not go well. He would vote down everything from the county, they are a run away government in Malone and their spending is out of control. The Town is doing a good job of controlling their spending.

Supervisor Robert Tebbutt replied that he is trying to keep in touch with the County Legislature. The County is redistricting the Town. He is very proud of the highway and the board as they have been able to keep the budget down to a 1.6% increase and he wishes the County could do the same.

Dave Johnson said he has been following several big projects and the cost of steel has gone up 40% for them. People are questioning where the building material increases are coming from. How is the Town going to stay within its budget with the increases?

Joe Garso speculated that fuel prices are going to go up and the cost of steel is dependent on fuel costs.

Supervisor Robert Tebbutt said the cost of the project is going to cost 25% to 30% more because the Town waited a year. He said he visited a garage that was just finished being built and because they acted last year they got a loan for 2%. The financing today is at 5%. Next year it will be 10% or 8% or another figure he can't guess. Today we have less of a building for the same cost. It will cost \$50,000 more to build next year. It is costing a lot of money to keep putting this project off.

Tracie Santagate said that the people who did vote last year are being demonized for costing the Town money. It should be noted that the Board put the project out to bid with Town Offices attached without ever connecting with any of the people to determine if a building should be built.

PUBLIC HEARING (HIGHWAY GARAGE PROJECT) -TOWN OF BRIGHTON

APRIL 1, 2004

Page 6

Supervisor Robert Tebbutt said he would not allow her to attack people; this hearing is to talk about the garage project.

Lydia Wright said Tracie Santagate was right and that he couldn't say that because the people voted on the bond issue that they cost the Town so much money.

Supervisor Robert Tebbutt said he was not making that conclusion; he was only stating a fact: that by putting off the project a year it is costing the Town more money. He is not demonizing anyone. The town is getting less of a building for more money if they build this year.

Lydia Wright said that by the Board not acting sooner the bid did not get out in a timely manner. She is a board member and she was uncomfortable by what he said and drew the same conclusion as Tracie Santagate.

Supervisor Robert Tebbutt said she misunderstood what he was saying and he will make it clearer. As a result of the vote last year the bond was defeated by 10 votes. As a result of the bond being defeated the Town is faced this year with a \$50,000 increase in costs to build. He is very supportive of the democratic process and is not demonizing anyone.

Tracie Santagate asked if when project was put out to bid, at approximately the same time as this year, did the Town face higher bid packages since it was so late in the season? Most of the contractors already had their work scheduled for the summer. Are we not paying a higher price for letting bids at this time?

Joe Garso said there is generally a premium for getting bids during the summer. When bids are let late in the fall or early winter for the next building season they are generally lower because bidders want to be ready to work in the spring.

Supervisor Robert Tebbutt said he was at the Keene garage that was just finished. They started building in November. He spoke to Conroy and Conroy and the cost to build during the winter was less than the cost of the increase of building materials. He talked to a contractor that bid on the garage last year and he said he would bid on the project again. They are looking for work at the end of the summer.

Gould Hoyt said the group here tonight is a small portion of the Town's residents. Is there some way the Board can get this information out to the Town?

Supervisor Robert Tebbutt is frustrated because he has sent letters and still only the same residents come to the board meetings. He can't get the whole town involved with this project. There were over 200 voters last time but the same 10 people come to the meetings. He doesn't know what else to do to get people involved.

Gould Hoyt said there is a reporter here tonight and he's sure she will do a good job covering this topic.

Supervisor Robert Tebbutt pointed out that the Town was on the front page of the paper last week. The focus of the paper's survey last week was about the garage and had the most responses to date of all the paper's surveys.

Gould Hoyt said not everyone gets the paper.

Dave Johnson said not everyone could be here tonight because they are working, their life issues are more important to them than this meeting. These people are very interested in the issue but they can't be here.

Supervisor Robert Tebbutt said he isn't getting the response from the community he expected. They can get to a meeting once in a while.

Dave Johnson said he know people who would volunteer their labor to build this garage if it was allowed.

PUBLIC HEARING (HIGHWAY GARAGE PROJECT) -TOWN OF BRIGHTON

APRIL 1, 2004

Page 7

Supervisor Robert Tebbutt has been in touch with the Comptroller's Office and the insurance company on the issue of volunteer labor and the Town has been told not to go that route. If there were any problems with the project who would the Town call to fix it? Who pays for injuries on the job?

Nik Santagate – McColloms: Asked for help in understanding the Class account mentioned earlier. There are two separate Class accounts, one with \$141,000 in it.

Supervisor Robert Tebbutt said the Class account is a depository for extra funds that can collect interest. There are other funds in non-interest bearing accounts. It's a saving account for the Town. The surplus Highway funds are in one account and the surplus General Funds are in another. Only the General fund account can be used for building the Town garage.

Nik Santagate asked if there would be any money left in the surplus account for maintaining the rest of the Town's buildings. There is a citizens committee working on the Town Hall and they have asked for funds to maintain the building.

Supervisor Robert Tebbutt said he couldn't say yes to that because it would depend on the cost of the garage. There is only one emergency issue before the Board at this time and it is the garage project. The Town Hall is not an emergency situation. There are funds to maintain the Town Hall. The larger portion of the fund is going to go to the garage. He would like to hear comments from the other Board members.

Dave Knapp said he didn't think the Town should neglect the maintenance on other buildings that needs to be done. There is a roof on a cemetery building that needs to be repaired.

Supervisor Robert Tebbutt said there was money budgeted for that repair.

Steve Tucker said that the citizens committee for the Town Hall received a report from an architect on the Town Hall and that nothing needs to be done right away.

Supervisor Robert Tebbutt said that the committee divided the suggestions into three phases addressing maintenance, restoration, and an addition. The maintenance will be addressed. There were funds added to the budget to address maintenance.

David Knapp said the concern is that the other Town buildings will be neglected and become emergencies like the garage if maintenance is not kept up on them. Residents don't want to see the Board turn a blind eye to everything else because the garage is costing so much.

Supervisor Robert Tebbutt said he sees the garage as the main concern for the Town.

Lydia Wright said there are some concerns with the Town Hall that need to be addressed because they could become a liability. She brought them up at the last board meeting (i.e.; the heating system, the back and front steps, the stone pillars). The Board needs to be concerned about these issues also.

Supervisor Robert Tebbutt said he is concerned with the buildings but he can't see adding an addition to the Town Hall this year when the Highway Garage needs the funds.

David Knapp said the committee is only asking for matching funds to be available to show that the Town is willing to support the project.

Lydia Wright said it wasn't fair to deplete the Town's surplus funds only for the garage. What is the guarantee that \$600,000 is enough for this project. At what amount will the Board cap the project? There is a large investment in highway equipment and it has to be protected, but the Board cannot ignore the other facilities in the Town as has happened in the past. She would like to see that stopped.

PUBLIC HEARING (HIGHWAY GARAGE PROJECT) -TOWN OF BRIGHTON

APRIL 1, 2004

Page 8

Supervisor Robert Tebbutt said she is only 20% of the voting power on the board. The rest of the board probably agrees that the building need to be maintained, but personally he is hard pressed to spend any money on the Town Hall for restoration or adding on to it. The emergency is across the street (at the Town Garage) as far as he is concerned. He would like to see the Town Hall taken care of but not this year. The Town cannot spend any more than it can afford. He can't guarantee that the garage will only cost \$600,000 and not a penny more.

Lydia Wright asked what the Board would do if the cost of the project is more than the bond issue. She asked the question as a citizen 6 months ago and she is asking it again as a board member. What happens if the project goes over budget? What is the cap for this project?

Nik Santagate asked if the Board could get back to his question about the surplus funds. What is the requirement the Comptroller says the Town should have in the bank?

John Quenell said the recommended reserve minimum is 25% of a fund's appropriations for the year.

Lydia Wright asked what this figure was.

John Quenell said that the general fund appropriations are \$375,000 for 2004, so \$94,000 is what the Town can keep in reserve. Right now the account is "fat" because all the tax money has been paid to the Town for the year.

Nik Santagate said he was quite surprised to hear that extra maintenance money was put in the budget for the Town Hall and was wondering how much that was. The last time the question was asked the account was under utilities.

John Quenell said the account covers several things and the Town budgeted an additional \$500 for maintenance of the Town Hall. This is small but the committee didn't have any figures at the time the budget was completed.

Nik Santagate said he felt everyone on the Board was dedicated to maintenance. He asked if the Board was in earnest searching out the letters from the insurance company (NYMIR). There are a number of things the insurance company has indicated are critical. The supervisor pointed out the garage but there are other things. Has the Board addressed all the items under risk reduction from the August 15, 2003, letter?

Supervisor Robert Tebbutt said that the Town has responded to the letter and taken action on most things except those that can't be addressed until the snow is gone. This was made part of the public record two meetings ago {regular board meeting for March}. He also said he had spoken to the Comptroller's Office and that they were in agreement with the Town spending the surplus funds on the garage project.

Nik Santagate said he was glad the Comptroller's Office is in agreement with spending \$100,000 for the garage but they were not here to see people trip over the sidewalk and stairs as they come to meetings or to court on Wednesday evenings. They don't see the pillars falling down in the front of the Town Hall. They don't see the kids playing in the park. He knows the highway equipment needs to be protected but he can't see leaving inadequate funds for the rest of the Town.

Debbie McBride said she did have to be careful on the steps coming to this meeting. She would like to say she appreciates the Town Board because she has sat on the St. Bernard's School Board and has felt the frustration of trying to get people to meetings. She does understand not getting the appreciation for the job they have to do. She wants to know from the Board members who were on the Board when the (bond issue) vote was taken in the fall. What makes the Board think people are going to approve this bond now when it is for the same amount of money? She is concerned that the Town should only build what they can afford like she does with her budget.

PUBLIC HEARING (HIGHWAY GARAGE PROJECT) -TOWN OF BRIGHTON

APRIL 1, 2004

Page 9

Lydia Wright said she and Francis Hogan asked the same question at the last meeting. She is glad there is going to be a referendum vote for the Town's people to be involved. She asked to Board to voluntarily hold the referendum at the Board meeting before the petition was received. She is worried that the \$600,000 may not be enough. The cost of the project needs to be brought down. She is currently doing construction at her house and she can only do what she can afford.

David Knapp said he doesn't think the vote is going to pass the bond resolution. The vote was very close last year. The committee decided that five bays are needed. Personally he thinks a bay should be cut out and only four are needed. There could be two working bays. Equipment could be moved outside when vehicles need to be worked on. He spoke to the person who worked on the petition and she couldn't be here because she had a class. The people who signed the petition don't want this to reflect on the Highway Department, they are not opposed to a garage but are concerned about the cost. They would like to see a long range plan like what the Town Hall Committee has done with the Town Hall. What is the \$250,000 plan, what is the \$400,000 plan and what is the \$600,000 plan. This has been discussed with the Highway Garage Committee and Joe Garso. It may cost more in the long run to build it in parts, but it may cost less now to only build four bays with another section to house the administrative offices and cold storage. The footprint could remain the same and plan for adding on later. People have to live within their means and this means not doing it all at the same time. The current highway garage was not build all at one time. Because of the nature of the end bay on the current garage maybe the footing was not put in correctly and has caused the crack in the wall. This is Gould Hoyt's concern on the new building.

Bob Tummons said the end bay was put on to house the grader when it was purchased and asked when that was.

Don Oliver said that was in 1967.

David Knapp said he didn't like numbers but he measured the current garage and it is approximately 5,000 square feet. The shed storage is 420 square feet. The new building drawing excluding the utility room and storage space is about 6,000 square feet. This is approximately a one bay difference. The current garage is a four bay garage and not all the equipment can fit inside. Speaking as a citizen, the heating system is antiquated. There is a wood burner and a fuel oil boiler to heat the garage. Someone has to come in on the weekend to feed the wood burner to maintain the heat in the building. It is not cost effective to pay someone to come in on a weekend to keep the building heated when they don't have to come in to plow. He can't speak to the structural and engineering needs of the building but the cost will be high to make the current building meet the needs.

Debbie McBride asked what will happen if the bond resolution is defeated. What is the next step?

Supervisor Robert Tebbutt said he was brand new to the Board last year and this was all new to him. At first he doubted the Town needed a new garage. He had to educate himself as to what was really needed. He spoke to the Highway Department to find out what they really needed. He found out there were critical pieces of equipment that were not heated; they were left outside. Obviously the building was not large enough to house all the equipment. A building is needed that is big enough to get all the equipment under cover so it will work better in the winter, be protected from the elements so it lasts longer, and protect it from vandalism and children climbing on it. The roller isn't used in the winter so it could go into cold storage during the winter. He went to see garages in other towns to see what they were doing. In the Town of Keene they have almost twice as many roads as we do and eight employees. The cost of everything correlates to what we have. The average cost to maintain roads in New York State is \$15,000 to \$20,000 per road mile. Our figure is \$15,000 per road mile. The cost of the new garage makes it \$16,000 per road mile. None of the towns had a 50-year-old garage they were still using. He talked to the people who built the garages and they all touted in-floor heating. He came to his conclusions by supporting the plan that we had last year. The Town turned this down so he appointed a committee on which David Knapp and Rouse Fountain have worked very hard to come up with this new plan. He can support this plan because they did not take away the things he thinks are important for the buildings like keeping all the equipment covered and safe inside. After a year and a half of looking at this he doesn't see how the Town can build anything

PUBLIC HEARING (HIGHWAY GARAGE PROJECT) -TOWN OF BRIGHTON

APRIL 1, 2004

Page 10

smaller. All the towns he looked at have built the same size or larger. He doesn't know what the next step is; he has given this his best shot. He is standing behind this project. The figures are the same as last year.

Bob Sullivan asked what would the Board do if this were voted down.

Supervisor Robert Tebbutt said he did not know.

David Knapp asked Joe Garso if it was feasible to let the bids in an "a la carte" fashion. Can the bid for four bays be let with an addendum for a fifth bay? If the cost reaches an amount people are willing to pay then only build that.

Joe Garso said it could be done; that was how the last project was let out to bid. They are called bid alternates.

Gould Hoyt asked if this could be put on the ballot.

Debbie McBride asked how do you get the people to understand this. They come in here and vote but you never see them again to explain what they will vote for.

Supervisor Robert Tebbutt talked to a contractor about doing "a la carte" and was told it was too cost prohibitive to consider it. The cost to the median taxpayer is only \$14.00 per person. This is a reasonable amount considering how the budgets have been held down.

Gould Hoyt said that Supervisor Tebbutt is talking a great fight but he is not getting the message out to the people. He should take over the Corner Café and serve coffee and pie and talk to the people who won't come down the road to the meetings. He has to get the information outside this room and to the people. What more can the Board do to get the message out to the people?

Supervisor Robert Tebbutt said that this is a pill we have to swallow, nobody wants to build a new garage, nobody wants to spend the money on it, and nobody wants his or her taxes to go up one dollar. The reality is that the Town has a situation where this building is in serious trouble and the Town has to do something about it. The Committee has the plan down to the point where half the taxpayers in the town are going to pay \$14.00 extra a year for the next 30 year. The people are asking for Plan "C" and "D"; he is running out of ideas. It seems so affordable right now. The APA is giving time to the Town but they won't wait much longer. The cost reduction for taking off a bay might reduce their cost from \$14 to \$12. It is worth giving up a bay for \$3 a year?

Tracie Santagate said she thinks people would be willing to pay the extra taxes if they thought they were getting their money's worth. People see the Town is reluctant to compromise. An honest housecleaning might be appropriate. Some pieces of equipment are not used all the time; maybe they could be rented.

Gould Hoyt said the information should get out to other people.

Dave Johnson said that the people can't vote on national or county issues but they can vote at the local level.

A discussion was held on how to get this information out and in what format.

The Town will hold an Informational Meeting/"Open House" at the Town Highway Garage on Saturday, April 24, 2004, from 10 a.m. to 12 noon so people can see the Highway Garage. A proposed plan will be available for people to review.

Supervisor Robert Tebbutt said this was the first meeting that people have offered good advice instead of criticism.

PUBLIC HEARING (HIGHWAY GARAGE PROJECT) -TOWN OF BRIGHTON

APRIL 1, 2004

Page 11

Art Robertson asked if people have changed their minds because they came to this meeting and heard this information.

Debbie McBride asked if Joe Garso could attend whatever meetings the Town sets up.

Gould Hoyt asked if the paper would express a sense of urgency for this issue so people will get involved.

William Ramsey - Canton: Said he was at this meeting by error but he wanted to say how interesting this meeting was and the Town should emphasize that the cost will only get higher if the Town is forced to replace the building.

Don Oliver said there are many people who voted against the garage and signed the petitions that have never been in the garage. This will be a good way to show them.

Bob Sullivan said that if the building is going to be torn down who will want to come to look at it.

Dave Johnson said anyone who plans to spend \$500,000 for a new one should see the old one.

Tracie Santagate said the people are voting on the money not on the design. She is not convinced that the Town is going to stay at \$600,000. People need to know the cost of the building and a break out of the other costs.

Gould Hoyt said people would have to see the old building and make up their own minds about the cost.

Debbie McBride said the "Letter to the Editor" by Don Oliver had too many facts and figures for people to comprehend; it should have had more down to earth reasons why the garage needs to be replaced.

Glen Perrino – Highway Department asked if there could be a "cap" on the project so the bidders know that \$600,000 is the limit.

Joe Garso said this has been tried with other projects and has not been very successful. Bidders submit what they want and ignore the project budget.

Francis Hogan – Rainbow Lake: How many bids did you have before and how many people took applications?

Joe Garso said he had 18 plan holders and received four bids back.

Francis Hogan said he talked to a plan holder who drove over the roads in the Town and said the Town can't afford the \$500,000 for the project so that company didn't bid.

Art Robertson said the people on the lakes would pay for this project not the people on the roads.

Nik Santagate said he works for people on the lakes and he would hear about it this summer. There is a trickle down effect from these camps, they pay more taxes and the employees get less salary.

Tom Willis- Garondah Road: The facts are this project will cost \$35,000 over 30 years. The Town could eliminate things from the budget and pay for this over time. The cost to pave roads is \$35,000 a year. The Town could build the garage instead of pave roads. This cost could be absorbed into the budget with making it an incremental increase.

Pat Willis asked if the design could be changed to have two cold bays instead of one.

David Knapp said this is what his idea would be with an extra cold bay. Have a wash bay with two heated bays and a zone under the office space would reduce living costs. Concrete would be reduced.

PUBLIC HEARING (HIGHWAY GARAGE PROJECT) -TOWN OF BRIGHTON

APRIL 1, 2004

Page 12

Joe Garso wasn't able to say how much this would save. Possibly \$30,000 to \$50,000.

Pat Willis said this the information needed at the "Open House".

David Knapp said the bids could be let out with a basic plan and then have addendums for variations to the plan.

Supervisor Robert Tebbutt said the difference to the median taxpayer would be \$1 if the project were cut by \$40,000.

David Knapp said he thought the total project cost was more a concern then the individual taxpayer's cost.

Supervisor Robert Tebbutt said the savings wasn't that great to have less of a building.

Bob Sullivan said he would like to see a break out of the cost of the project.

Discussion was held on how to get the information out to the residents. Postcards of bright colors will be sent to residents. This will be discussed at the next Town Board meeting.

Chris Godfrey said he was having trouble agreeing with the math. He asked how much of the taxes collected goes to the Town of Brighton.

John Quenell said it is shown on the tax bill.

Supervisor Robert Tebbutt thanked the Highway Department for attending and asked if they had any other comments.

There were no more comments from the public.

Supervisor Robert Tebbutt Adjourned the Public Hearing at 9:43 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Elaine W. Sater
Brighton Town Clerk